RECEIVED U.S. E.P.A.

BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENTAL APPEALS BOARDUL 21 51 12:10

U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENOVE APPEALS BOARD

4

WASHINGTON, D.C.

ORDER SCHEDULING STATUS CONFERENCE

IN THE MATTER OF: :
IN THE MATTER OF: :
CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU,: NPDES Appeal No.
SAND ISLAND WASTEWATER : 09-01
TREATMENT PLANT
HONOULIULI WATEWATER
TREATMENT PLANT
NPDES Permit No.
HI0020117
NPDES Permit No.
HI0020877

Monday, July 19, 2010

Administrative Courtroom Room 1152 EPA East Building 1201 Constitution Avenue, NW Washington, DC

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing, pursuant to notice, at 3:00 p.m.

BEFORE:

RIGNUL

THE HONORABLE KATHIE A. STEIN, ENVIRONMENTAL APPEALS JUDGE

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

APPEARANCES:

(202) 234-4433	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701
	NT: alle Wenisch, Board Counsel a Durr, Clerk of the Board
and	Region 9 U.S. EPA 75 Hawthorne Street Mail Code ORC-2 San Francisco, CA 94105-3901 (415) 972-3930 (415) 972-3570 fax STEPHEN J. SWEENEY, ESQ. LEE SCHROER, ESQ. U.S. EPA Office of General Counsel 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Mail Code 2355A Washington, DC 20460 (202) 564-5491 (202) 564-5477 fax
<u>Protection</u>	<u>Behalf of the Environmental</u> <u>Agency Region IX</u> : ANN S. NUTT, ESQ. Environmental Protection Agency
and of:	<pre>(202) 373-6000 (202) 373-6001 fax CARRIE K.S. OKINAGA, ESQ. KATHLEEN KELLY, ESQ. City and County of Honolulu 530 South King Street, Room 110 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813</pre>
of:	DAVID B. SALMONS, ESQ. ROBERT V. ZENER, ESQ. Bingham McCutchen, LLP 2020 K Street, NW Washington, DC 20006
	<u>Behalf of the Sand Island and</u> <u>Wastewater Treatment Plants</u> :

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

T-A-B-L-E O-F C-O-N-T-E-N-T-S

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrg/055.com

1	P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S
2	3:00 P.M.
3	MS. DURR: All right, the Board of
4	the United States Environmental Protection
5	Agency is now in session for a status
б	conference in re: City and County of Honolulu,
7	permit numbers HI0020117 and HI0020877, NPDES
8	Appeal number 09-01. Honorable Judge Kathie
9	Stein presiding. Please turn off all cell
10	phones, and no recording devices allowed. You
11	may be seated.
12	JUDGE STEIN: Good morning,
13	counsel. With me on the bench here is
14	Michelle Wenisch, who is one of the senior
15	counsel for the board, who is assisting in
16	this particular matter.
17	And if we could take a few
18	moments, perhaps starting here and going out
19	to Region IX in Hawaii, just so that I am
20	familiar with everybody who's present, and who
21	they are representing. Why don't we start
22	with the City and County of Honolulu?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealigross.com

1	MR. SALMONS: Yes, Your Honor.
2	Would you like me to stand, or just
3	JUDGE STEIN: No, that's fine.
4	MR. SALMONS: Okay. I am David
5	Salmons, for the City and County of Honolulu.
6	With me is my associate Bryan Killian.
7	JUDGE STEIN: Okay.
8	MR. SALMONS: And then we have on
9	teleconference from Honolulu, I believe,
10	Kathleen Kelly, from the City and County of
"1 "i 	Honolulu.
12	JUDGE STEIN: Okay.
13	MR. SWEENEY: Stephen Sweeney,
14	from the Office of General Counsel. With me
15	at counsel's table is Lee Schroer, and in
16	Region IX, presenting on behalf of the Region
17	today is Ann Nutt.
18	JUDGE STEIN: Thank you,
19	everybody. I appreciate your appearance here,
20	and I appreciate also both the joint status
21	report, and the supplemental status report
22	that Region IX filed on Friday, I believe.

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

11

/

www.neatrgross.com

 $\mathbf{5}$

Has everybody had an opportunity to see that supplemental status report?

MR. SALMONS: Yes, Your Honor.

JUDGE STEIN: But the supplemental status report that Region IX provided was very helpful to the Board in having a sense of what the board should be thinking about in this case. Aná I want to give each side an their views. opportunity to let us know particularly the City and County of Honolulu.

11 I think this is probably clear 12 from the orders that we've issued in this 13 case, the Board has invested a considerable 14amount of time in this matter. It's always 15 hard to predict at what point a decision will 16 emanate from the Board, since there's 17 obviously a panel of three, but I think it's 18 fair to say that we're not at the beginning of 19 our review of this matter.

And obviously that's why it was so important to us to try to figure out where are we, is this matter being settled, is there

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

 $\mathbf{2}$

3

4

5

6

•7

8

9

10

20

21

22

www.nealrgross.com

1	nonethelesss a value to our proceeding?
2	So why don't we start first with
3	hearing any additional views from the Agency
4	and Region IX, and then we'll hear from the
5	City and County of Honolulu.
6	MS. NUTT: Good morning, Your
7	Honor. This is Ann Nutt. I am here for the
8	Region. And I think we pretty much laid out
9	in our supplemental status report to the joint
10	status report what our position is. I think,
11	basically, we would say that we appreciate
12	that this is the Board's decision to make, and
13	it's not ours.
14	We really tried to provide
15	information that would assist the Board in
16	making a decision as to deciding whether or
17	not to issue its decision. We don't oppose
18	the stay, particularly if a decision was not
19	really on the verge of being ready to be
20	issued.
21	So, that being said, we would
22	value the issuance of a decision, because
	NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.neeirgroes.com

1 there some uncertainties about а are $\mathbf{2}$ settlement going final. We don't want to 3 overplay the uncertainties, because we intend 4 to make every effort to ensure that it does go 5 through, it's entered by the judge and becomes 6 final, in which case a decision in this matter 7 would not have been necessary. 8 But until it happens, we believe 9 that the controversy is still alive on the 10 permit appeal, and frankly we would benefit 11 from the decision, because it would provide 12 instruction on how the Board makes its 13 decision on certain issues that are at issue 14 in this case that could affect other 301(h) 15 cases. 16 It would be instructive to know 17 how the Board would rule on several of the 18 issues presented in this appeal. We have, as 19 you know, two other 301(h) decisions on appeal 20 before the Board now, in Guam. There are five other 301(h) modified permits in effect now in 21 22 the region, and two of them are in American

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1	Samoa. And the Region has issued tentative
2	decisions to deny in those. So, I think
3	that's pretty much where we are in the Region.
4	JUDGE STEIN: Well, I really want
5	to tell you that the Board very much
6	appreciated the supplemental status report,
7	because it provided us a lot of information
8	that we didn't have, that helps put this
9	matter in context for the Board. So we
10	appreciate that.
11	Is there anything else, Mr.
12	Sweeney, that you'd like to add?
13	MR. SWEENEY: Nothing further to
14	add, Your Honor.
15	JUDGE STEIN: Okay. Counsel?
16	MR. SALMONS: Yes, Your Honor.
17	Thank you. I do think that the City and
18	County of Honolulu has a different perspective
19	in terms of what the proper course of action
20	is for the Board at this stage. We feel like
21	the best course of action, the most
22	appropriate and the most reasonable and we

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

certainly respect the fact that the Board has put a lot of effort into this, and understand the desire to, perhaps, see it to a conclusion.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

But we do think that, given that the parties have reached an agreement in terms, that the City Council has approved that agreement, and that there are remaining steps that we are concerned not be complicated in any way through the potential publication of an opinion.

We think the best course of action at this point is to stay the proceedings, wait to issue any decision in this case, until we know for sure whether the settlement becomes final.

17 If it does, then the case is over 18 and pursuant to the agreement we will move to 19 dismiss our appeal. If it doesn't, then of 20 course the Board should issue any decision 21 that it has. And I guess I would just briefly 22 address the three reasons that Region IX

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

propounds as to why the Board should issue its decision. And I'll take them one at a time.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

The first is, they say that the entry of the final consent decree remains uncertain. And while I think that is certainly true, it's that uncertainty that causes us to prefer that the Board not issue its decision, because we don't want to do anything that will increase the uncertainty.

10 And to the extent there is 11 uncertainty, I think the proper course is to 12 wait and see. If it plays out so that there, 13 in fact, is no consent decree, then the Board 14 can issue its decision at that time, and the 15 six-month delay will really -- or whatever the 16 delay may be, the weeks or months that it will 17 be, would have not done anything to frustrate 18 the effort the Board has put into the case 19 already.

20 If, in fact, the case has settled, 21 and that becomes final, then there is no need 22 for the Board's opinion, and so the

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

uncertainty, in and of itself, is not a reason to issue an opinion now. If anything, I think the uncertainty supports waiting and seeing whether there's a need for an opinion.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

1.9

The second point that they raise is that there is still a live and genuine controversy between the Region and the City and County of Honolulu. And I guess I disagree with that as a substantive matter, there clearly is not. We have reached an agreement in principle in terms of the issues related to this proceeding.

While it is a technical matter that it is not final yet, there is not an ongoing disagreement or dispute between the parties as to how they should act going forward. We, in fact, have reached that agreement. And we just are waiting for that to become final.

20 And then the third reason is this 21 point about the amount of work that's been 22 done and the impact on future cases, which

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 again, while we certainly appreciate that a 2 lot of work has gone into this case by 3 everyone concerned, including the City and 4 County of Honolulu, that's true in a]] 5 litigation that settles at this stage. 6 And I don't think that's a reason *7 in and of itself to issue a decision when the 8 parties have agreed to settle. And I don't 9 know enough about the other cases the Region 10 has in mind to have much of an opinion as to 11 whether anything in this decision is likely to 12 impact that. I don't think it's particularly 13 likely, but I don't know. 14But at the end of the day, I think 15 that's not a reason to potentially risk 16 increasing opposition to the settlement 17 agreement as it works its way through the 1.8 approval process. 19 So what remains to be done is, I 20Your Honor may know from the think as 21 agreement that was filed on Friday, is that it 22 needs to be executed by all of the parties

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 concerned. And then there's a public notice 2 period, and then a response to those notices, 3 and then it will be submitted to the District 4 Court in Honolulu to become final. 5 And we will then withdraw our 6 appeal before the Board. And there's enough 7 left in that that we are concerned that we 8 preserve the status quo for now. The parties 9 have spent a lot of time and work going into 10 the settlement of this, as well as the 11 litigation. 12 And not just the parties here, but 13 this is a multi-party agreement that includes 14 the State, and the City and County, and non-15 governmental organizations, and the Federal 16 Government. And we don't want to do anything 17 that might jeopardize that. 18 JUDGE STEIN: in а Are you 19 position to say how you believe -- I mean, 20 given that, as I understand the terms of the

have agreed to put in secondary treatment and

settlement, the City and County of Honolulu

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

(202) 234-4433 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

21

22

www.neairgross.com

, T	have negotiated with the Region for a time
2	period extending out for many years to do
3	that, how is it that the Board's issuance of
4	a decision would jeopardize that agreement?
5	MR. SALMONS: Well, it's
6	JUDGE STEIN: But obviously
7	neither you know nor I know how the Board is
8	going to rule.
9	MR, SALMONS: Exactly, Your Honor.
10	JUDGE STEIN: So the Board could
11	rule in favor of Honolulu, it could rule in
12	favor of the Region, it could do a number of
13	things in between.
14	MR. SALMONS: And that's precisely
15	my point, I think the City and County is
16	primarily concerned with adding any additional
17	layers of uncertainty to the uncertainty that
18	currently is there.
19	And this is obviously a process
20	that was done through confidential
21	negotiations because of the fact that there
22	are groups and interested parties and others

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

·····

www.nealrgross.com

in the public that may not agree with everything that's here. And they want to work it out in substance.

1

 $\mathbf{2}$

3

4 There's a public notice process, 5 and depending on how some of those issues 6 could be resolved in an opinion, I could 7 imagine circumstances in which certain groups 8 that otherwise would be making objections to 9 the terms ΟÊ the consent decree, their 10 be made stronger arguments may or more 11 relevant based on what was in the opinion, in 12 terms of whether, for example, this was a good 13 deal or not a good deal. Or whether it was 14 necessary or not necessary.

15 Again, it's hard to speculate. Т 16 think if you start with the premise that we 17 all agree on, that there is some uncertainty 18 left in this process, I think that would cut 19 pretty consistently in favor of not doing 20 anything that would increase the uncertainty. 21 There is a lot of work and effort, 22 think a lot of fine balances and I anđ

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE (SLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

reflected in that 1 compromises that are 2 And it has to go through this agréement. 3 approval process, and we don't want anything 4 that might potentially undermine it. 5 JUDGE STEIN: In the ordinary 6 when parties engaging in course. are a 7 settlement negotiation that may affect the 8 Board's decision, the parties come to us at an 9 early phase and ask us to stay our hand. So 10 this case obviously comes to us in a somewhat 11 different posture. 12And that, obviously, will be among the things that the Board will look at. If I 13 14understand Region IX's report correctly, and 15 if I understand the record, there is, however, 16 another petition that is unaffected by the 17 parties' settlement. That there is another 18 challenge to the Region's action that the 19 Board would still need to rule on in any 20 Is that correct? event. 21 I think the answer MR. SALMONS: 22to that is potentially. As I understand it,

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.neatrgross.com

that's the Moreland Petition. I don't
JUDGE STEIN: You're not a party
to this, so I don't want to go into much
detail.
MR. SALMONS: I don't think it was
fully briefed. I don't think it's been
presented to the Board. I don't think it's
ripe for a decision. And I don't think it
presents the same questions that our petitions
did.
And so I think there are
substantial differences, as well. Certainly
to the extent that that remains live, and the
Moreland Petitioners want to continue even
after there's been a settlement, that's
another question that remains to be seen. I
don't know the answer to that either.
That could potentially go forward,
but the issues that we raised would be
resolved by this settlement agreement. The
last thing I would just say, Your Honor, is
that it makes the process, I think, somewhat

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1	complicated and unusual if the Board were to
2	issue a decision now. And let's assume that
3	the remainder of the approval process takes
4	several months to play itself out.
5	Because of the uncertainty, the
6	City and County of Honolulu presumably
7	whichever way it went, the losing party before
8	the Board may have to file a petition for
9	review with the Ninth Circuit in the interim,
10	just to preserve their rights in the event
11	that the settlement agreement did not become
12	final, but then ask for a stay immediately.
13	And I just think it looks
14	unsusual, after it's publicly known that the
15	parties have reached an agreement, to have a
16	court, or a board, in these circumstances,
17	issue the decision. And it makes procedural
18	complications down the road that I think are
19	best avoided, to be frank.
20	JUDGE STEIN: I think I've got a
21	clear understanding.
22	MR. SALMONS: And I would just
	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON D.C. 20005-3701 www.peakoros

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

19

(202) 234-4433

www.neairgross.com

	add, toe, that I think Your Honor is right,
2	that the parties should have brought this to
3	the Board's attention sooner. And I regret
4	that we did not, I think that it was, on our
5	side, anyway, largely an oversight.
6	And I certainly understand and am
7	very sympathetic to the frustration the Board
8	must feel about that. But I do view that as
9	separate from the question of what's the best
10	thing to do now, in terms of issuing the
7 1	decision or not.
12	And I think, for the reasons we've
13	articulated, the safest, and the most
14	reasonable, and the most appropriate, and the
15	most common course in these circumstances is
16	to wait and see.
17	JUDGE STEIN: I'd like to give
18	Region IX and EPA Headquarters, if they want,
19	an opportunity to respond to the points that
20	have been raised by counsel for the City and
21	County of Honolulu.
22	MS. NUTT: This is Region IX. I
	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.neelrgro

www.neeirgross.com

think the one I would highlight to respond to
is whether or not there is a live controversy
that continues. It's an unusual position to
be in to be arguing that there is a
controversy, when we have a settlement.
And I think we're together on
that. The controversy does not concern the
settlement, but concerns the substance of the
issues regarding EPA's 301(h) decisions which
are before the Board. And should that
continue, there would be adversity between the
parties on that issue.
We're sympathetic, definitely, to
the potential for having to file a petition in
the Ninth Circuit. I don't think we want to
waste judicial resources, particularly, that
is, the due process that is afforded a
petitioner in these permit appeal proceedings.
So, certainly the Region would
work with CCH to do whatever they could to
provide for any stays or relief from a
vices beiefing achodule in that should

rigorous briefing schedule in that, should

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.neetrgross.com

that occur.

1

2	JUDGE STEIN: Does the Region
3	share the view of the City and County of
4	Honolulu that the Board's issuance of a
5	decision under such circumstances could
6	jeopardize the settlement?
7	MS. NUTT: I think we feel there's
8	less risk of that than, perhaps, the City
9	does. There is some risk. There is always
10	some risk. And I think we've kind of looked
11	at the risks and weighed them against the
12	benefits of having a decision issued, and
13	that's why we're taking the position that we
14	do.
15	JUDGE STEIN: I do think that one
16	of the issues the Board will look at is the
17	extent to which the issues that are present in
18	this case are likely to be present in other
19	301(h) cases.
20	We have had one 301(h) case
21	before, which was also fairly resource-
22	intensive, several years ago. We have other

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 pending petitions in Guam, but I think --2 obviously, we're a board of limited resources. 3 We have ten staff attorneys. 4 So if I tie up a staff attorney 5 for a year on this case, it isn't so much that 6 we've used ten percent of our resources, but 7 it's a question of what else we're not getting 8 to. 9 And I think that the Board has 10 been coming from, in terms of future cases and 11 wanting to know, is if there's a reasonable 12 chance that something is going to become moot, 13 it's generally preferable for us to know that 14 earlier in the process. 15 And nobody has crystal balls, 16 here, but generally in terms of juggling 17 different things going forward, I do think the 18 Board will take all of this into account. 19 if T']] see there are anv 20 additional comments that either side would 21 like to make, but basically, what my plan 22 would be is to sit down with the other judges

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1	on the panel, following the conclusion of this
2	conference, and then make some decisions about
з	what we think is appropriate under the
4	circumstances.
5	Is there anything else from EPA
6	Headquarters? General Counsel's Office?
7	(No response.)
8	City and County of Honolulu?
9	MR. SALMONS: I don't think so,
10	Your Honor.
11	JUDGE STEIN: Well, I appreciate
12	your time, I appreciate your being present.
13	Now that I've seen your consent decree, I
14	appreciate the complexity of the issues.
15	And we will hope to issue
16	something in the near term. I am out of town
17	next week, so I don't know whether anything
18	will come down this week, or it may wait to
19	the following week.
20	But I appreciate your efforts very
21	much. Let me ask just one final question. I
22	think we have everything we need, and we
	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 BHODE ISLAND AVE. N.W.

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

I

www.neairgross.com

		25
1	appreciate everybody's time. Session is now	
2	adjourned.	
3	(Whereupon, the above-entitled	
4	proceeding was concluded at 3:23 P.M.)	
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgrost	s.com

Pa	g	е	2	6

2.00

ſ			_		
;	A	appropriate 9:22	briefed 18:6	19:1	C-O-N-T-E-N-T-S
	above-entitled 1:19	20:14 24:3	briefing 21:22	complications	3:10
	25:3	approval 13:18	briefly 10:21	19:18	- 1/2
	account 23:18	17:3 19:3	brought 20:2	compromises 17:1	D
	act 12:16	approved 10:7	Bryan 5:6	concern 21:7	David 2:4 5:4
	action 9:19,21	arguing 21:4	Building 1:17	concerned 10:9	day 13:14
	10:12 17:18	arguments 16:10	2 unding 1.1.)	13:3 14:1,7 15:16	DC 1:18 2:6,21
	add 9:12,14 20:1	articulated 20:13	C	concerns 21:8	deal 16:13,13
	adding 15:16	assist 7:15	CA 2:16	concluded 25:4	deciding 7:16
	additional 7:3	assisting 4:15	CARRIE 2:8	conclusion 10:4	decision 6:15 7:12
	15:16 23:20	associate 5:6	case 6:8,13 8:6,14	24:1	7:16,17,18,22 8:6
		assume 19:2	10:14,17 11:18,20	conference 1:4 4:6	8:11,13 10:14,20
	address 10:22	attention 20:3	13:2 17:10 22:18	24:2	11:2,8,14 13:7,11
	adjourned 25:2	attorney 23:4	22:20 23:5	confidential 15:20	15:4 17:8 18:8
	Administrative	attorneys 23:3	cases 8:15 12:22	consent 11:4,13	19:2,17 20:11
	1:16	Avenue 1:18 2:20	13:9 22:19 23:10	16:9 24:13	22:5,12
	adversity 21:11	avoided 19:19	causes 11:7	considerable 6:13	decisions 8:19 9:2
	affect 8:14 17:7		CCH 21:20	consistently 16:19	21:9 24:2
	afforded 21:17	В	cell 4:9	Constitution 1:18	decree 11:4,13 16:9
	Agency 1:2 2:12,13	B 2:4	certain 8:13 16:7	context 9:9	24:13
	4:5 7:3	balances 16:22	certainly 10:1 11:6	continue 18:14	definitely 21:13
	ago 22:22	balls 23:15	13:1 18:12 20:6	21:11	delay 11:15,16
	agree 16:1,17	based 16:11	21:19	continues 21:3	deny 9:2
	agreed 13:8 14:22	basically 7:11	challenge 17:18	controversy 8:9	depending 16:5
	agreement 10:6,8	23:21	chance 23:12	12:7 21:2,5,7	desire 10:3
	10:18 12:11,18	beginning 6:18	Circuit 19:9 21:15	correct 17:20	detail 18:4
	13:17,21 14:13	behalf 2:2,11 5:16	circumstances 16:7	correctly 17:14	devices 4:10
	15:4 17:2 18:20	believe 5:9,22 8:8	19:16 20:15 22:5	Council 10:7	differences 18:12
	19:11,15	14:19	24:4	counsel 2:19,24	different 9:18
	alive 8:9	bench 4:13	City 1:8 2:9 3:17	4:13,15 5:14 9:15	17:11 23:17
	allowed 4:10	benefit 8:10	3:20 4:6,22 5:5,10	20:20	disagree 12:9
	American 8:22	benefits 22:12	6:10 7:5 9:17	counsel's 5:15 24:6	disagreement
	amount 6:14 12:21	best 9:21 10:12	10:7 12:7 13:3	County 1:8 2:9	12:15
	Ann 2:13 5:17 7:7	19:19 20:9	14:14,21 15:15	3:17,20 4:6,22 5:5	dismiss 10:19
	answer 17:21 18:17	Bingham 2:5	19:6 20:20 22:3,8	5:10 6:10 7:5	dispute 12:15
	anyway 20:5	board 1:1 2:24,25	24:8	9:18 12:8 13:4	District 14:3
	appeal 1:8 4:8 8:10	4:3,15 6:6,7,13,16	clear 6:11 19:21	14:14,21 15:15	doing 16:19
	8:18,19 10:19	7:15 8:12,17,20	clearly 12:10	19:6 20:21 22:3	due 21:17
	14:6 21:18	9:5,9,20 10:1,20	Clerk 2:25	24:8	Durr 2:25 4:3
	APPEALS 1:1,23	11:1,7,13,18 14:6	Code 2:15,21	course 9:19,21	D.C 1:3
	appearance 5:19	15:7,10 17:13,19	come 17:8 24:18	10:12,20 11:11	
	APPEARANCES	18:7 19:1,8,16	comes 17:10	17:6 20:15	E
	2:1	20:7 21:10 22:16	coming 23:10	court 14:4 19:16	earlier 23:14
	appreciate 5:19,20	23:2,9,18	comments 23:20	Courtroom 1:16	early 17:9
	7:11 9:10 13:1	Board's 7:12 11:22	common 20:15	crystal 23:15	East 1:17
	24:11,12,14,20	15:3 17:8 20:3	complexity 24:14	currently 15:18	effect 8:21
	25:1	22:4	complicated 10:9	cut 16:18	effort 8:4 10:2
	appreciated 9:6		comprised to./	cut 10.10	11:18 16:21
				I	l

.

Page	27
rage	41

efforts 24:20	forward 12:17	HI0020877 1:13	21:9 22:16,17	limited 23:2
either 18:17 23:20	18:18 23:17	4:7	24:14	litigation 13:5
emanate 6:16	Francisco 2:16	Honolulu 1:8 2:9	issuing 20:10	14:11
engaging 17:6	frank 19:19	2:10 3:17,20 4:6	ITEM 3:12	live 12:6 18:13 21:2
ensure 8:4	frankly 8:10	4:22 5:5,9,11 6:10	IX 2:12 3:14,19	LLP 2:5
entered 8:5	Friday 5:22 13:21	7:5 9:18 12:8	4:19 5:16,22 6:5	look 17:13 22:16
entry 11:4	frustrate 11:17	13:4 14:4,21	7:4 10:22 20:18	looked 22:10
Environmental 1:1	frustration 20:7	15:11 19:6 20:21	20:22	looks 19:13
1:2,23 2:11,13 4:4	fully 18:6	22:4 24:8	IX's 17:14	losing 19:7
EPA 1:17 2:14,19	further 9:13	Honor 5:1 6:3 7:7		lot 9:7 10:2 13:2
3:14 20:18 24:5	future 12:22 23:10	9:14,16 13:20	J	14:9 16:21,22
EPA's 21:9		15:9 18:21 20:1	J 2:18	
ESQ 2:4,4,8,8,13	G	24:10	jeopardize 14:17	M
2:18,18	General 2:19 5:14	Honorable 1:23 4:8	15:4 22:6	Mail 2:15,21
Eurika 2:25	24:6	Honouliuli 1:9 2:2	joint 5:20 7:9	making 7:16 16:8
event 17:20 19:10	generally 23:13,16	hope 24:15	judge 1:23 4:8,12	matter 1:6,19 4:16
everybody 4:20	genuine 12:6		5:3,7,12,18 6:4	6:14,19,22 8:6 9:9
5:19 6:1	getting 23:7	<u> </u>	8:5 9:4,15 14:18	12:9,13
everybody's 25:1	give 6:8 20:17	imagine 16:7	15:6,10 17:5 18:2	McCutchen 2:5
Exactly 15:9	given 10:5 14:20	immediately 19:12	19:20 20:17 22:2	mean 14:19
example 16:12	go 8:4 17:2 18:3,18	impact 12:22 13:12	22:15 24:11	Michelle 2:24 4:14
executed 13:22	going 4:18 8:2	important 6:21	judges 23:22	mind 13:10
extending 15:2	12:16 14:9 15:8	includes 14:13	judicial 21:16	modified 8:21
extent 11:10 18:13	23:12,17	including 13:3	juggling 23:16	moments 4:18
22:17	good 4:12 7:6 16:12	increase 11:9 16:20	July 1:15	Monday 1:14
	16:13	increasing 13:16		months 11:16 19:4
F	Government 14:16	information 7:15	<u> </u>	moot 23:12
fact 10:1 11:13,20	governmental	9:7	K2:5	Moreland 18:1,14
12:17 15:21	14:15	instruction 8:12	Kathie 1:23 4:8	morning 4:12 7:6
fair 6:18	groups 15:22 16:7	instructive 8:16	Kathleen 2:8 5:10	move 10:18
fairly 22:21	Guam 8:20 23:1	intend 8:3	Kelly 2:8 5:10	multi-party 14:13
familiar 4:20	guess 10:21 12:8	intensive 22:22	Killian 5:6	
favor 15:11,12		interested 15:22	kind 22:10	<u> </u>
16:19	<u> </u>	interim 19:9	King 2:9	near 24:16
fax 2:7,17,22	hand 17:9	invested 6:13	know 6:9 8:16,19	necessary 8:7
Federal 14:15	happens 8:8	Island 1:8 2:2	10:15 13:9,13,20	16:14,14
feel 9:20 20:8 22:7	hard 6:15 16:15	issuance 7:22 15:3	15:7,7 18:17	need 11:21 12:4
figure 6:21	Hawaii 2:10 4:19	22:4	23:11,13 24:17	17:19 24:22
file 19:8 21:14	Hawthorne 2:15	issue 7:17 8:13	known 1 9:14	needs 13:22
filed 5:22 13:21	Headquarters	10:14,20 11:1,7	K.S 2:8	negotiated 15:1
final 8:2,6 10:16	20:18 24:6	11:14 12:2 13:7	T	negotiation 17:7
11:4,21 12:14,19	hear 7:4	19:2,17 21:12		negotiations 15:21
14:4 19:12 24:21	hearing 1:20 7:3	24:15	laid 7:8	neither 15:7
fine 5:3 16:22	helpful 6:6	issued 6:12 7:20	largely 20:5	Ninth 19:9 21:15
first 7:2 11:3	helps 9:8	9:1 22:12	layers 15:17	non 14:14
five 8:20	highlight 21:1	issues 8:13,18	Lee 2:18 5:15	nonethelesss 7:1
following 24:1,19	HI0020117 1:12	12:11 16:5 18:19	left 14:7 16:18	notice 1:20 14:1
	4:7		let's 19:2	16:4
	•		•	-

Page	2	8
------	---	---

			_	
notices 14:2	pending 23:1	16:19	20:14 23:11	15:11 17:19
NPDES 1:8,11,12	Pennsylvania 2:20	primarily 15:16	reasons 10:22	10,111 11119
4:7	percent 23:6	principle 12:11	20:12	S
number 4:8 15:12	period 14:2 15:2	probably 6:11	record 17:15	S 2:13
numbers 4:7	permit 1:11,12 4:7	procedural 19:17	recording 4:10	safest 20:13
Nutt 2:13 5:17 7:6	8:10 21:18	proceeding 7:1	reflected 17:1	Salmons 2:4 5:1,4
7:7 20:22 22:7	permits 8:21	12:12 25:4	regarding 21:9	5:5,8 6:3 9:16
NW 1:18 2:5,20	perspective 9:18	proceedings 10:13	region 2:12,14 3:14	15:5,9,14 17:21
1111 1.10 2.3,20	- petition 17:16 18:1	21:18	3:19 4:19 5:16,16	18:5 19:22 24:9
0	- 19:8 21:14	process 13:18	5:22 6:5 7:4,8	Samoa 9:1
objections 16:8	petitioner 21:18	15:19 16:4,18	8:22 9:1,3 10:22	San 2:16
obviously 6:17,20	Petitioners 18:14	17:3 18:22 19:3	12:7 13:9 15:1,12	Sand 1:8 2:2
15:6,19 17:10,12	petitions 18:9 23:1	21:17 23:14	17:14 20:18,22	schedule 21:22
23:2	petitions 18.9 23.1 phase 17:9	proper 9:19 11:11	21:19 22:2	SCHEDULING
occur 22:1	1 -			1:4
Office 2:19 5:14	phones 4:10 plan 2 3:21	propounds 11:1 Protoction 1:2 2:12	Region's 17:18	Schroer 2:18 5:15
24:6	PLANT 1:9,10	Protection 1:2 2:12 2:13 4:4	regret 20:3 related 12:12	seated 4:11
Okay 5:4,7,12 9:15	PLANT 1:9,10 Plants 2:2			second 12:5
OKINAGA 2:8		provide 7:14 8:11	relevant 16:11 relief 21:21	secondary 14:22
ongoing 12:15	play 19:4	21:21		see 6:1 10:3 11:12
opinion 10:11	plays 11:12	provided 6:5 9:7	remainder 19:3	20:16 23:19
11:22 12:2,4	Please 4:9	public 14:1 16:1,4	remaining 10:8	seeing 12:3
13:10 16:6,11	point 6:15 10:13	publication 10:10	remains 11:4 13:19	seen 18:16 24:13
opportunity 6:1,9	12:5,21 15:15	publicly 19:14	18:13,16	senior 4:14
20:19	points 20:19	pursuant 1:20	report 5:21,21 6:2	sense 6:6
oppose 7:17	position 7:10 14:19	10:18	6:5 7:9,10 9:6	separate 20:9
opposition 13:16	21:3 22:13	put 9:8 10:2 11:18	17:14	session 4:5 25:1
ORC-2 2:15	posture 17:11	14:22	representing 4:21	settle 13:8
ORDER 1:4	potential 10:10	P-R-O-C-E-E-D	resolved 16:6 18:20	settled 6:22 11:20
orders 6:12	21:14	4:1	resource 22:21	settlement 8:2
ordinary 17:5	potentially 13:15	p.m 1:20 4:2 25:4	resources 21:16	10:15 13:16 14:10
organizations	17:4,22 18:18	0	23:2,6	14:21 17:7,17
14:15	precisely 15:14		respect 10:1	18:15,20 19:11
overplay 8:3	predict 6:15	question 18:16 20:9 23:7 24:21	respond 20:19 21:1	21:5,8 22:6
oversight 20:5	prefer 11:7	questions 18:9	response 3:19 14:2	settles 13:5
O-F 3:10	preferable 23:13	quo 14:8	24:7	share 22:3
0-1 3.10	premise 16:16	quo 14:0	review 6:19 19:9	side 6:8 20:5 23:20
Р	- present 2:23 4:20	R	right 4:3 20:1	sit 23:22
PAGE 3:12	- 22:17,18 24:12	raise 12:5	rights 19:10	six-month 11:15
panel 6:17 24:1	presented 8:18	raised 18:19 20:20	rigorous 21:22	somewhat 17:10
particular 4:16	18:7	reached 10:6 12:10	ripe 18:8	18:22
particularly 6:10	presenting 5:16	12:17 19:15	risk 13:15 22:8,9	sooner 20:3
7:18 13:12 21:16	presents 18:9	ready 7:19	22:10	South 2:9
parties 10:6 12:16	preserve 14:8	really 7:14,19 9:4	risks 22:11	speculate 16:15
13:8,22 14:8,12	19:10	11:15	road 19:18	spent 14:9
15:22 17:6,8,17	presiding 4:9	reason 12:1,20 13:6	ROBERT 2:4	staff 23:3,4
19:15 20:2 21:12	presumably 19:6	13:15	Room 1:17 2:9	stage 9:20 13:5
party 18:2 19:7	pretty 7:8 9:3	reasonable 9:22	rule 8:17 15:8,11	stage 7.20 15.5
F				

Page 29

stand 5:2	12:11 14:20 16:9	20:6	21:20	9
start 4:21 7:2 16:16	16:12 20:10 23:10	understanding	works 13:17	92:14 3:17
starting 4:18	23:16	19:21		94105-3901 2:16
State 14:14	Thank 5:18 9:17	United 4:4	<u> </u>	96813 2:10
States 4:4	thing 18:21 20:10	unsusual 19:14	year 23:5	972-3570 2:17
status 1:4 4:5 5:20	things 15:13 17:13	unusual 19:1 21:3	years 15:2 22:22	972-3930 2:17
5:21 6:2,5 7:9,10	23:17	U.S 1:2 2:14,19		
9:6 14:8	think 6:11,17 7:8			
stay 7:18 10:13	7:10 9:2,17 10:5	V	ZENER 2:4	
17:9 19:12	10:12 11:5,11	V 2:4	0	
stays 21:21	12:2 13:6,12,14	value 7:1,22	~	
Stein 1:23 4:9,12	13:20 15:15 16:16	verge 7:19	09-01 1:8 4:8	
5:3,7,12,18 6:4	16:18,22 17:21	view 20:8 22:3	1	
9:4,15 14:18 15:6	18:5,6,7,8,11,22	views 3:14,17,20	110 2:9	•
15:10 17:5 18:2	19:13,18,20 20:1	6:9 7:3		
19:20 20:17 22:2	20:4,12 21:1,6,15		1152 1:17	
22:15 24:11	22:7,10,15 23:1,9	W	1200 2:20	
Stephen 2:18 5:13	23:17 24:3,9,22	wait 10:13 11:12	1201 1:18	
steps 10:8	thinking 6:7	20:16 24:18	19 1:15	
Street 2:5,9,15	third 12:20	waiting 12:3,18	2	•
stronger 16:10	three 6:17 10:22	want 6:8 8:2 9:4	20 3:20	
submitted 14:3	tie 23:4	11:8 14:16 16:2		
substance 16:3	time 6:14 11:2,14	17:3 18:3,14	200062:6	
21:8	14:9 15:1 24:12	20:18 21:15	2010 1:15	}
substantial 18:12	25:1	wanting 23:11	202 2:6,7,22,22	
substantive 12:9	today 5:17	Washington 1:3,18	2020 2:5	
	town 24:16	2:6,21	20460 2:21	
supplemental 5:21		waste 21:16	2355A 2:21	
6:2,4 7:9 9:6	treatment 1:9,10	Wastewater 1:8		
supports 12:3	2:2 14:22	2:2		
sure 10:15	tried 7:14	WATEWATER	3:00 1:20 4:2 3:23 25:4	
Sweeney 2:18 5:13	true 11:6 13:4	1:9	1	
5:13 9:12,13	try 6:21	way 10:10 13:17	301(h) 8:14,19,21	ļ
sympathetic 20:7	turn 4:9	19:7	21:9 22:19,20	1
21:13	two 8:19,22	week 24:17,18,19	373-6000 2:6	
T	Т-А-В-L-Е 3:10	weeks 11:16	373-6001 2:7	
table 5:15	U	weighed 22:11	4	
table 5:15 take 4:17 11:2	unaffected 17:16	Wenisch 2:24 4:14	415 2:17,17	
	uncertain 11:5	went 19:7	4152.17,17	
23:18		we'll 7:4	5	-
takes 19:3	uncertainties 8:1,3	we're 6:18 21:6,13	530 2:9	
technical 12:13	uncertainty 11:6,9	22:13 23:2,7	564-5477 2:22	
teleconference 5:9	11:11 12:1,3	we've 6:12 20:12	564-5491 2:22	
tell 9:5	15:17,17 16:17,20	22:10 23:6	JU9-J971 2.22	
ten 23:3,6	19:5	whichever 19:7	7	
tentative 9:1	undermine 17:4	withdraw 14:5	7 3:14	
term 24:16	understand 10:2	work 12:21 13:2	75 2:15	
terms 9:19 10:7	14:20 17:14,15,22		,	
		14:9 16:2,21		

CERTIFICATE

· ^ * ^,

΄,

ŝ.

This is to certify that the foregoing transcript

in the matter of: City and County of Honolulu Sand Island Wastewater Treatment Plant and Honouliuli Wastewater Treatment Plant

Before: Hon. Kathie A. Stein Environmental Appeals Judge

Date: July 19, 2010

Place:

1

* 5-22-0

Washington, D.C.

represents the full and complete proceedings of the aforementioned matter, as reported and reduced to typewriting.

Sam Wojach Sam Wojack

(202) 234-4433